

**This transcript has been produced in line with accessibility standards and is available in English only.**

## **Transcript**

November 21, 2023

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Good morning, everybody and welcome here this morning, Holly lovely for you to join us.

Do you want to just pop yourself on mute and turn the camera off? Brilliant, thank you very much. So we're just in the process of letting a few more people come into the lobby. So I'm just going to give it 2 minutes before we start the presentations. Just bear with us.

For those of you that are just joining us, we're just going to give a couple of minutes for the lobby to come into the meeting and then we'll get started.

And I think we will go. Fabulous Croeso bawb, welcome everyone.

0:1:7.810 --> 0:1:8.660

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Dwi'n Rebecca Masters Ymgynghorydd Iechyd Cyhoeddus a Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru.

I am Rebecca Masters, Public Health Consultant at Public Health Wales, where I'm the Strategic Lead for Climate Change. And I am delighted to welcome you all here today.

This event has been organised by a collaboration between Public Health Wales, Public Health Network Cymru and Natural Resources Wales, with the aim of bringing together colleagues working across Wales who have an interest in undertaking climate change risk assessments in partnership with Public Service Boards, as well as those who are keen to understand the impacts of climate change and what it may mean for themselves and their work within Wales.

0:1:43.30 --> 0:2:8.290

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

We have had a huge volume of you sign up from sectors all across Wales and our partner organisations and we are really, really delighted to have you with us this morning on what is quite a crisp and clear day up in the North.

So jumping straight in, climate change is recognised as the most significant public health threat of the century, endangering physical health, mental health and wellbeing. It threatens all areas of life that impact our ability to achieve and maintain good health. In October 2021, the World Health Organization declared that climate change was the single greatest threat facing humanity due to rising global temperatures. The impacts of climate change are multifaceted, impacting the social and environmental determinants of health, and are already being felt within Wales, both in terms of physical threats to life through extreme weather events, as well as climate related anxiety.

In short, climate change is already adversely impacting the health of people in Wales, and it will continue to do so well into the future. We know that some communities in Wales are likely to be more adversely impacted by the effects of climate change than others, and some are less likely to be

able to take action to respond to those effects. For example, lower income households in areas that are prone to flooding and those living with disabilities or chronic conditions and their carers.

As such, the effects of climate change are likely to exacerbate existing health inequalities in Wales, and this is one of the greatest reasons why we need to act. We are hugely fortunate in Wales to have the world leading Well-being of Future Generations Act, which ensures that climate change is considered as an everyday decision making. The climate change risk assessments are an integral part of our Public Service Boards' response to the climate crisis and outline how they will meet their responsibilities under the Well-being of Future Generations Act.

0:3:33.600 --> 0:3:36.970

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

How those are done can be determined locally and led by local need. However, to do them properly, you do need to incorporate a broad set of standards. And it is this practical how to that we hope we can support you with here today.

We have a fabulous array of speakers working across Wales in different sectors who are leaders in adaptation planning. The event today provides an opportunity for yourselves to gain a greater understanding of what adaptation planning is required, as well as outline what additional supports you believe is required so that we can better be placed to support you to undertake them. We have a focus on the practical how to as well as sharing learning and the importance of involving community members. Then we've got a couple of breakout sessions for you later on, which go into greater depth about hazard analysis and the practicalities of undertaking work locally, so please do pop your questions in the chat as we'll be taking note of these and using them to frame the Q&A sessions that we've got on after the break.

You'll also be able to pop your specific questions to speakers, so please do use that chat function. There are no daft questions and all feedback is welcome. During the session if you can keep your cameras and mics off unless you're a presenter talking, then that would be great, thank you.

And I am now going to hand you over to my colleague, Nerys Edmonds who is going to talk you through some Climate Change in Wales, the Health Impact Assessment work she's been recently working on, and what does climate change mean to different people with communities in Wales?

Thank you, Nerys.

0:5:3.240 --> 0:5:4.290

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

Thanks, Rebecca. I'm just getting my slides up so thanks everybody for making time for this event today, we're really pleased to see you here and also thanks to all our speakers who are supporting the event. We really appreciate your time and input. Can I just check that my slides are sharing please?

0:5:25.620 --> 0:5:26.510

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yeah, you're great Nerys.

0:5:26.470 --> 0:5:27.180

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

OK, Brill. Thanks Rebecca.

So I'm going to talk about some of a few key findings from this health impact assessment which we have carried out in the Wales Health Impact Assessment Support Unit along with a number of partners and also some reflections from that learning that I think hopefully will be helpful for the local climate change risk assessments and pointing you in the direction of some of the outputs and resources from the HIA that we hope can be useful for local climate risk assessments.

So first off, I think sometimes when you were approach consideration of climate risk, it can feel like you're lost in quite a complicated maze. And this is certainly how I felt quite a few times when carrying out the health impact assessment. There's a lot of facts and figures and data and evidence out there and some quite complex projections to get your head around. And even if you kind of drill down to the most basic summary that the Met Office provide in that climate change will mean warmer, wetter winters and hotter, drier summers with sea level rise and increased extreme weather, it can still be a real challenge to then interpret those projections to really think about what does this mean for different population groups and communities in Wales and what action do we need to take?

0:6:53.840 --> 0:6:58.760

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

So when we undertook the health impact assessment, we really try to think about setting some clear objectives and focus to the impact assessment to help guide us through navigating that evidence and our first objective was to look at the impacts of climate change from a holistic perspective. Thinking about both the physical health impacts, the mental health impacts, but also impacts on social well-being, economic and environmental well-being. And we really wanted to consider how is this going to affect people's lives, where they live, work, learn and play and that might sound simplistic, but actually thinking about the evidence in terms of, you know, we don't all live in kind of 1, our lives take place in lots of different settings, lots of different places. We have lots of different roles and lots of different facets to our identity and our susceptibility to climate change impacts. And we really wanted to try and get that more integrated perspective in the health impact assessment. We wanted to provide evidence to ensure that health and wellbeing were integrated into adaptation planning and processes like local climate risk assessments.

0:8:8.780 --> 0:8:13.260

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

The other thing we did to help us navigate that maze was to use some maps. And some of the maps that we used were looking at climate change through the lens of the wider determinants of health and wellbeing, on the left there, but also very strongly related to those well-being goals such as community well-being, economic well-being, environmental well-being. The other map that we used was this framework which was developed by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation as part of their work around climate disadvantage. And I found this really helpful because it begins to break down into different elements that you can then bring together to think about different elements that make people maybe more vulnerable to climate impacts and then that can help with the design of responses and adaptation planning.

0:9:5.890 --> 0:9:25.450

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

So I'm going to spend a few minutes to take us through this. So this map basically as you can see it centres around climate disadvantage and the contributing factors to that including the type of hazard that people face from climate change, whether they're exposed to it and how vulnerable they are to those risks. And I'm going to talk us through this step by step.

So when we think about the hazards from climate change, there's a whole range that we are facing, including flooding, drought, wildfires, landslides, other extreme weather, higher temperatures, that's a number of examples. So what we looked at in the health impact assessment is what do these hazards mean for health and well-being?

So I'm only going to pick a couple of examples today, but the first one I'm going to look at is flooding. Now flooding obviously, can cause risk to life. It can cause injury and contaminated water can also cause gastrointestinal illness, but actually one of the major and longer-term impact of flooding is actually around mental health. And we know from a long-term study in England that people who experience flooding, whose homes are flooded, are six times more likely to have anxiety, depression or post-traumatic stress disorder than those people who are unaffected by a flood. This has huge implications for the mental health and well-being of our population, and I'll be talking a bit more about how many people are exposed to that hazard in a moment.

0:10:38.810 --> 0:10:50.320

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

If we look at another hazard, which is higher temperatures and extreme heat, we know that extreme heat can cause mortality, particularly from respiratory, cardiovascular and dementia related conditions. But there's also a number of other health outcomes that are affected, including incidents of heat related illness, negative impacts on birth outcomes, injury, social isolation, and worse symptoms of mental disorder, and all of this can put it increased demands on our health services. So those hazards have some very direct impact on a range of health outcomes.

The next bit of this triangle I'm going to look at is thinking about exposure, because not everybody will be exposed to all impacts, but some may be more. And this exposure can happen because of the places that people spend time. And it also is influenced by where you live. So where is your neighbourhood? Are you by the coast where you might be more exposed to coastal erosion and flooding? Are you living in an urban area that will be more at risk of urban heat island effects? You know, if there's not enough shading or green space in an urban area, there will be a greater chance of overheating.

People may also be exposed to climate impacts through their work. So if you're an outdoor worker, you will be more exposed to extreme heat in your work and that's something that will need consideration in how we manage health and Safety at work. You may be more exposed because of your home. If you live on a top floor flat, your home is going to be more at risk of overheating. If your home is already damp or has a leaky roof, you are going to be more exposed to some of our heavy rain and storms. So one of the ways we can begin to unpick some of these impacts is thinking about how people are exposed to some of these impacts and what does that mean in terms of our planning or adaptation interventions.

0:12:38.190 --> 0:12:43.440

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

Thinking about when I was talking about just now those mental health impacts of flooding, we know this is the latest data from Natural Resources Wales about those long-term flood projections. We are going to see a significant number of people exposed to flooding. We already have a significant number, but over the next 100 years we're going to see nearly 100,000 more people exposed to flooding from the sea and 60,000 more people exposed to flooding from rivers. So we know that a significant proportion of our population in Wales is going to be exposed to those mental health impacts from flooding. And as I said, that's got very major implications for how we think about protecting community wellbeing.

Now I'm going to talk about vulnerability and vulnerability has got a number of different aspects to it. So sensitivity is how maybe how sensitive you are to particular impact. So if you have particular long-term condition like respiratory condition or a heart condition or if you have dementia, you are more sensitive to heat impacts and the 2nd element of this is about adaptive capacity and this is how able you are to prepare, respond and recover from climate impacts. And this may be because of your income, it may be if we look at children, children are dependent on adults for a lot of that preparation and response, so they have some limitations to their adaptive capacity or for other people for a range of reasons they may have less resources to prepare, respond and recover from climate related impacts. So both of these elements feed into vulnerability and I'm going to give a couple of examples of that now.

0:14:24.780 --> 0:14:33.870

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

So when we look at higher temperatures and extreme heat, we have a number of population groups who are more sensitive to this and their health is more at risk. So older adults, now we know that Wales has got an ageing population. We've got quite high proportion of elderly people in our population, and they are more vulnerable to heat related illness. As we've mentioned, people with long term conditions such as respiratory or heart conditions are more vulnerable as well and we've got again a significant proportion of our population with long term health conditions. Babies and younger children are more vulnerable as are our homeless people and those with alcohol or drug dependence. So these all need to be part of our planning for higher temperatures and extreme heat.

0:15:14.910 --> 0:15:38.320

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

And then I'm going to bring these elements together now to talk about some particular population groups, because I do think the strength of a population or place based approach such as the Public Service Board led local climate risk assessments give us that opportunity to take that more integrated perspective on different groups and places.

So if we look at children, we know that they are more sensitive to changes to their diet and nutrition because they're growing. So any impacts around food security, they will be particularly sensitive to. Depending where they live, they may be more exposed to things like flooding, and they are very affected by the stresses and strains on the adults in their family. So we know from studies around flooding that children's mental health is very much impacted by flooding as well.

Children's education could be disrupted by changes from extreme weather if their school has to close or if there's overheating in the classroom. There's evidence that that affects their learning. Depending on the nature of her child's home, whether that's damaged by a storm or overheat, that could also impact them.

And we also know that play and leisure facilities are really important to children's well-being. We can see, probably you may have experienced this as well as I have, but playing fields being flooded which is disrupting sport, we may have playgrounds that do not have any shading which means that during heat waves there isn't anywhere safe for children to go and play. So there's a number of areas where children's well-being will be impacted and when we bring that together around a particular population or place, we can get that more integrated understanding.

Looking at coastal communities as well we consider that there's particular sensitive and vulnerable groups in coastal communities like older adults, but also in some areas, concentrations of people living on a low income which will affect their ability to invest in adaptation and prepare and respond to climate change. For example, some people might not be able to afford to insure their house.

0:17:30.950 --> 0:17:36.690

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

Coastal communities are likely to be affected by a lot of uncertainty, anxiety, particularly because of sea level rise and about what the future of their community is. And this can also impact on economy, the local economy and tourism. So there's a whole range of different impacts that will impact coastal communities and I think the local assessments were a really good opportunity to think about that in a holistic way.

When we carried out the health impact assessment, we also found that there were a few key themes really that went beyond the sort of more direct impact of our changing climate but were related to the process of how we manage and plan for climate change that also impacts health and wellbeing. So I think these are important in terms of local climate risk assessments because actually how we engage communities, how we communicate risk can affect how people feel and their anxiety and uncertainty about the future. And I think we've got some really good speakers this morning who are going to talk about approaches to involvement and how do we engage communities in that dialogue about climate risk and how to do that in a way that helps promote and protect and give them some sense of control and involvement in decisions about the future.

0:18:54.800 --> 0:19:10.950

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

So moving on to thinking about the local climate risk assessments, I think they offer a really good opportunity to integrate, to work in collaboration and to involve people, all of which will be really important in planning for the future. Considering looking at climate change through the lens of local well-being through the well-being goals provides a really good opportunity to get a much more integrated and collaborative approach to climate change at the local level. And recognising that we don't have to have all the answers. There are people around us with insights, with expertise and knowledge that can help us bring those pieces of the puzzle together. And I think that's going to be a real theme of this morning about how we bring those different perspectives and insights and expertise together to get that full picture.

So just to highlight, within the health impact assessment, there's a lot of different outputs and resources that can help support you with your local climate change risk assessment. We've got a summary report. We've got downloadable chapters, infographics, a PowerPoint slide deck and we've got chapters across each of the determinants of health and chapters looking at a whole range of different population groups that can hopefully help inform your assessment.

So I'm going to leave it there. I'm going to hand back to Rebecca and hope you have a good morning, Thank you.

0:20:27.280 --> 0:20:28.130

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Thank you, Nerys. That was a fabulous presentation and I think it's important the point that you made around bringing everybody's expertise together so that we can greater understand the whole picture is a really key one and one of the greatest reasons why we put this webinar together today. Because we all, nobody is able to articulate the whole challenge individually. This really is a partnership between those working in different sectors and people bring different elements to those conversations. So I think that's a really key one for us.

Chris has popped something in the chat around supporting health impact assessment in the Education Centre and I think that's something we can have a little bit of a think about behind the scenes and think through about how we can respond to that more fully in the Q&A session afterwards. So thank you for popping that into the chat Chris. And please do everybody else, if you've got a question pop it into the chat. We'll make sure that we respond to everybody.

0:21:18.380 --> 0:21:21.100

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

I'd really like to welcome Doctor Alan Netherwood today who is going to talk us through sharing learning from local climate adaptation work in Wales. So Doctor Alan Netherwood is from Sustainable Futures and is an Honorary Research Fellow at Cardiff University. And we are absolutely delighted to have him here with us today. So I'm going to hand it over to you Alan, please go for it.

0:21:42.730 --> 0:21:43.560

Dr. Alan Netherwood

Thank you Rebecca. Bore da, s'mae. Can I just check that the slides are up and running please?

0:21:51.110 --> 0:21:52.20

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

They are absolutely.

0:21:52.840 --> 0:21:53.730

Dr. Alan Netherwood

Fantastic, Thank you.

So I've had about 20 years being pickled in climate risk as a public service practitioner, as a consultant, as an academic. I do a lot of work with the clients whose logos are on there over the years including Local Authorities and Public Service Boards. So I'm going to talk quite a bit about Pembrokeshire Public Service Board. They're the one Public Service Board that have undertaken a climate risk assessment and get into some of the detail. And as well as this work I run a climate

leadership program for Welsh Local Government Association. So this is for Members and senior officers, and we've had really good take up and I would say climate risk assessment is as much about leadership as it is about the technicality, and I'll come back to that in a moment.

0:22:49.520 --> 0:23:14.920

Dr. Alan Netherwood

So I'm going to mainly talk from a kind of practitioner and research perspective over the next 20 minutes and come down in scale from national to actually granular local just to give you some food for thought as you embark on these climate change risk assessments and take some broad lessons, both good and bad, from the work that I've undertaken. So I'm going to go on to the next slide.

It's a busy slide. The bit in the middle there, the table, is some work I'm doing at the moment for Denbighshire County Council on adult social services and climate risk. It's still well underway, so I can't kind of share all of the results, but this is a table which is really the preliminary piece of work as part of that Commission to look at the 61 risks that have come up in the climate change risk assessment, which is UK and Wales wide and think about service planning and service delivery related to those 61 risks. Now there's some points I want to make about CCRA3.

I was involved in the UK work and authored the Welsh Summary report and I think you know my lessons from that in terms of climate change risk assessment at a macro scale is that actually the assessment is a means to an end, and I know that sounds obvious, but the assessment isn't the end in itself. What the assessment is, I'll label it with an analogy, it's like triage. So it's to identify strengths, gaps, weaknesses, actions, responsibilities and what you need to deliver on to become more climate resilient. And ultimately the assessment should be used as a tool to think about reorganising resources in institutions to address climate risk.

So you know, if you undertake these assessments, they need to be velcroed into delivery systems. Otherwise it may just be another report that's gathering dust on the shelf, and I think if you start with the end in mind, the assessment needs to be resulting in actions to build climate resilient. I think the last thing we want across Wales is a whole hive of industry getting into incredible detail and nothing happening as a result of it.

So the final thing I want to say about CCRA3, and there is brilliant interpretative stuff done by other people and not me around what this means for public policy, is the modelling and the science has actually been done for you. What your task is, is to interpret those risks in your localities from either a service or a business context. So it's not about the issue, it's about the response to the issue and so I'd really urge you to think about a proportionate approach to evidence gathering and I'll come back to that as I talk about the first example I'm going to draw on, which is Pembrokeshire's climate adaptation strategy.

0:26:14.480 --> 0:26:28.230

Dr. Alan Netherwood

This this was a partnership project I kind of led on the methodology and actually delivering the thing and it just gives a flavour of how we approached in Pembrokeshire. Some of this stuff you might want to take on board, some of it might not be appropriate.

It was a six-month program, and we had a series of workshops and through that process began to distil a series of actions that the Public Service Board needed to deliver.



So we looked at the 61 risks through a series of workshops, the first one was information sharing. So across the county, what information have we already got? What are we already doing so that actually we were focusing on well, what do we need to do in addition to that. That was the first workshop. Second workshop was about exploring best practice. How are other municipalities and counties approaching this. Is there anything that we can learn from good and bad practice. I must say if you click on that link, not now but later on, the methodology we've used has been published online so other people can use it.

OK, so there's a lot more detail I'll be behind this. Then we went into a series of exercises to prioritise actions across the county ending up with 39 priorities. And the way that we did that, we set up what we call local expert surgeries around 4 themes, environment, business and industry, communities and infrastructure. And we got as many people in as we could. We cherry picked them to give us a real sense of how those 61 risks might play out in Pembrokeshire. So for example, thinking about sinkholes or post-industrial environments and the idea of dispersed pollution down to potential health impact. So we ran these for a month, and we got some priorities emerging. We consulted countywide on the priorities and ended up with 24 actions. Actions that actually need leading and resourcing, and this is my view. At this point when we've done the risk assessment and we said Well, in order to address these risks, we need to do these 24 things over the next five years, that was when the Public Service Board needs to come into its own. And I think there was a bit of a shock that that there was a requirement to do something after this. So a bit of learning is that stuff will emerge from your risk assessments that need to be managed, delivered and resourced.

0:29:6.600 --> 0:29:17.900

Dr. Alan Netherwood

A final thing I want to say about the strategy countywide, I think it's as much about institutions reorganising their existing resources to manage risks. There's no money tree, so you know, how can you organise yourselves across the Public Service Boards to fill these gaps? So there's more information on the actions when you click on that link later on.

The second piece of work in Pembrokeshire, which was commissioned after that was about protocol and you know it would be really interesting to hear from Meilys later on about Fairbourne, because I think there's a number of potential Fairbournes around the Pembrokeshire coast and so this piece of work was to think about how institutions and communities can work together moving forward and to plan for climate risk. And as part of this, one of the things we had to recognise that different communities in your patches are going to experience climate risk differently over time.

So this isn't about emergency planning and tidying up after a storm. This is about a slow accumulation of climate risks in different communities across your patch. And what this diagram illustrates is that we'll have different experiences. Some communities will be able to cope and bounce back very short term and reactive. You know you're preparing for more of the same extreme events through emergency services. So, it happens, you mop up, it happens, you mop up. Other communities will need to be planning for change. So this is where multiple cascading risks over time become almost part of the evolution of the community. And it's there where I think work needs to be done around increasing understanding, thinking about shaping places and shaping services and delivering services in the new climate. And I think that's particularly pertinent to the health and social services agenda.

And then the third type of community, and Fairbourne is perhaps one of them, I certainly think this is the picture we're going to be dealing with in coming decades, is preparing communities for radical change from climate risk. And this is long term where we're going to need, as a combination of institutions, to increase understanding and shape services. And then in more extreme cases, shape decommissioning of that community. And that I think the skills that need to be developed in public services around that would be really interesting to hear from Meilys later on about that.

0:32:6.60 --> 0:32:11.460

Dr. Alan Netherwood

So the next slide, this is really to get over the issue that we've got a lot of data. This table shows data of all the communities across Pembrokeshire and surface, tidal and fluvial flooding and those that are at risk. So it's drawn from stuff that was in the well-being assessment Natural Resources Wales data and the right-hand side is the kind of 2025 to 2055 management approach to coastal change.

And I think the point here is we have a lot of data, we can get better at sharing it, but interpreting that data to think about multiple climate risks is necessary. I know that sounds nobby and really obvious, but I wonder about our capability as public bodies to actually analyse that data and think across this range of risks. So in Pembrokeshire they pretty much know where there are going to be some squeaky areas, where communities are going to be at this kind of cumulative risk. But I think you know this is about looking beyond just flood risk and thinking about risks to communities, health, infrastructure, business and industry and the ripple effect. The combined effects over time in each place. And as part of the protocol work, we did some work on a on a kind of scenario, a hypothetical community that was getting what we call this slow burn of climate risks over time. And so the blue blobs there are things that tend to come out in climate risk assessments around areas where adaptation planning has to occur. So that's the blue circles. The narrative I guess next to each of these blue circles are the problems.

And I think the challenge for public services is to ensure that those problems and issues affected into service delivery because you know, this isn't about going off and developing a whole kind of climate change and approach independent of service delivery. This is about baking it in or putting it in like Blackpool rock, so I think the adaptation occurs in services around those different areas. So social care visits might be compromised. So in Denbighshire, we're doing some work to think about what that looks like spatially, but it may also inform service planning and in terms of how they develop their kit. So it's not as simple as just providing local social care visits. It's about thinking through these repeated incidents and building in resilience. So I think all of these will be familiar to you, these types of impact. But the service managers in local authorities and the service managers in the health boards need to be factoring this in.

0:35:33.330 --> 0:35:35.510

Dr. Alan Netherwood

OK, I've only got a couple of more slides left.

I think the other point or piece of learning I wanted to put across is that thinking about climate risk in place, you need to think about multiple and combined and cascading risks.

So here's an example where you might get these repeated severe weather incidents over time caused by climate change.

They are affecting trees which may seem kind of a bit abstract for health and social services, but trees impact on roads and slope stability and may impede your access for services. Certainly impact on roads may affect viability of town centres. They will certainly affect power cables and business continuity. So when you're thinking at Public Service Board level, actually baking climate risk into your capital program where you're looking after roads or baking it into your approach to economic regeneration and the viability of town centres, I would say is essential. So this is about taking a holistic approach, drawing on internal and external expertise, creating space for that dialogue. You know, it's not as simple as just increasing flood risk management. The ripple effect of climate change will be very different in Denbighshire's case you know from Llangollen in the South of the county to Rhyl and Prestatyn in the North of the county.

And so it's this planning for different combinations of climate risks. So I think the challenge for you doing countywide risk assessments is that you can have this homogeneous, you know, these are the climate risks that will affect I don't know, Ceredigion but actually it'll be very different in Aberaeron or Newcastle Emlyn or Aberystwyth.

0:37:41.360 --> 0:37:57.600

Dr. Alan Netherwood

And this is an example of the sort of material we're working with the Welsh Local Government Association on in the leadership program to make sure that the responsibility and the relevance is communicated to service managers across portfolios. This is not just the climate change manager's job.

And this is the final slide. I think my advice to you is multiple layers of risks need to be considered. And there's a temporal thing over time. So risks to service users, which can be immediate from individual events, but actually cumulative, certainly risks to support systems that support or impede services. So infrastructure, utilities, IT, combining in different places. Risks to your assets and your locations. So that's actually damaged from different severe weather events and flooding, but also access issues. And this is a really important one. Broader systemic risks on service demand over time. So Nerys talked about mental health issues and in the work in Denbighshire we've been talking about the Towyn flooding. About how they had to set up a special team for five years to pick up on the ripple effects on social services, this slow burn of impact.

So service demand over the medium and long term and I think part of this is about providing space and structure for different institutions to explore the agency they have to respond. And actually to think are we sufficient here, we're doing our best but actually there's some bloody big gaps here. And that needs to be part of the risk assessment. I think that that the middle box is really to reflect. I first saw the initial UK projections in 1998 when I was working for Cardiff Council and worked with them when I worked for the Environment Agency as their Climate Change Strategy Manager and we did some interesting work with the Welsh Local Government Association in the 2010s.

0:40:7.520 --> 0:40:14.280

Dr. Alan Netherwood

Then I've worked as a consultant in those different local contexts. My message is people get this if you give them the space to actually work on it. So whether it's local communities or whether it's middle or service managers, they get it. They just need to be provided with the context, the stimulus, the push back, the challenge. Final point Rebecca is this is about inter and intra institutional responses to the risks that you identify. So otherwise, you know you're going to come

up with risk assessments and people are going to say so what? That stuff will be nice to do, but we don't have any money and Welsh Government aren't requiring us to do this yet, so we won't, and they ought to be doing this and they should be doing that.

So do think about the governance associated with the risk assessment. Think about the processes that can enable these risks to be addressed. Think about communicating the scale and the consequences and what you don't know. Think about leadership. So who's going to take the risk management on, and certainly you know without a lot of money around, how do we reorganise our existing resources to respond.

I'll get off my soapbox now Rebecca. I hope that's been an interesting reflective piece for people.

0:41:47.540 --> 0:41:48.370

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Thank you, Alan. I could listen to you on your soapbox all day, frankly. So yeah, it's a really sobering presentation, but also really practical. We talk a lot, particularly in public health, about the hypothetical and how do you take that and apply it. My background is in community engagement, working in deprived communities on the ground to try and improve health and wellbeing. And so to take that experience and apply that to some quite theoretical work around, well, what actions do we need to take as systems leaders and how do we enable people working at all levels and in our own communities as well? What you've done is collate that challenge and put that into really practical steps. And I'm really incredibly grateful for you to share in that experience with us today.

The take home message to me really is about it being as much about leadership as it is around technicality and giving people that space and freedom. You've popped a link in one of your things to the Pembrokeshire example, so I've just popped that into the chat for people to go away with and have a look at because I think it's that practical how to stuff that people need to see. Like you say, people know this stuff and they get it. It's just having the headspace to be able to do that in our already quite busy, challenging day jobs. This is rarely a designated item for people within their day jobs. It's rarely written into people's job descriptions and the work plans that they have. So to give people that space, but also the practical knows how and show how is absolutely key. So thank you for that.

And you mentioned about trees and their impact on service delivery, and I was kind of reflecting. We talk in public health, we talk about trees from a shade perspective and the importance of trees and planting trees from a carbon capture perspective and all that aspect but you're absolutely right in terms of that road and the viabilities and how we, because we deliver services within Public Health Wales. We deliver all of the microbiology services, all of the cancer screenings, all the newborn screenings, huge amounts of physical service delivery goes on within Public Health Wales. And I don't think people often realise that. But actually how we can ensure that people are still able to get to their breast screening appointments if there's been a flood in Towyn. That's really important and definitely a take home message for me from today.

So diolch yn fawr iawn. Really grateful for your time and energy here today. So thank you. I look forward to any questions that people may have, so please do pop them into the chat.

0:44:18.150 --> 0:44:30.780

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

So I am now going to hand you over to my esteemed colleague Sara Elias, who's a Senior Policy Officer here within Public Health Wales, who is going to talk you through some learning from the communities and climate challenge in a future Wales project.

So welcome, Sara, and over to you.

0:44:34.500 --> 0:44:35.220

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

Hello. Thank you for having me, diolch. If I just manage to share my screen. And have you got that up on your end?

0:44:48.620 --> 0:44:49.360

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yeah, absolutely. You're good to go.

0:44:50.360 --> 0:44:50.720

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

Fab. So yeah, I think my presentation follows on quite nicely from Alan and Nerys' in terms of that importance of involving the public and the influence of coproduction and working together. So the project that I wanted to talk to you about is communities and climate change in a future Wales. The project itself was a joint project with the Office of Future Generations Commissioner and what we wanted to do is there's a dual focus, so kind of presenting that way as well, was to have a look at how we can involve people and communities in these types of discussions and also to kind of choose a topic that would be quite relevant and have insights. So we'll talk about the methodology, but also the insights that we had from the project as well.

So the project itself is part of a larger project that's been going on for two or three years now and the first part of it was a literature review that we did with Cardiff University that looked at inequalities in a future Wales and to really identify some key areas that we needed to address. And Sophie Howe, who was the Commissioner at that point and Tracy Cooper called for a different way of working so that we don't deepen inequalities. So we saw sometimes in the response to the pandemic or when there's a crisis response where we work very much in the here and now, we sometimes forget some of the elements that might deepen inequality. So how can we work to prevent that by thinking long term.

So what we wanted to do was have a demonstrator project which would focus on climate change and think about how do we really involve people in the long term and how do we integrate that with other pieces of work and collaborate across organisations for a preventative approach. Because I think what we've heard from Alan and Nerys is that importance for all five ways of working to come into play and work as a whole rather than a siloed approach. Public health Wales and the Office of Future Generations Commissioner commissioned Flint to demonstrate how we could effectively involve the public in this type of work.

0:47:17.700 --> 0:47:23.450

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

So Flint are an organisation that specialised in futures thinking or long term thinking. And they use a particular methodology called character led storytelling. So these aren't the normal type of presentations that you would get from a standard report. A lot of it was very illustrative because what we know and do individually, we all think about the future but actually to have that space to do it and to think quite systematically about the future is quite difficult and especially when we're asking for the public to help and work with us to think about the future. It's really difficult to step out from the here and now. And if you've only got a half day with a group then it's really difficult to have an exercise where you need to take them out of the here and now or give them the opportunity to express some of the problems that they're experiencing today and get them to focus more on what it might be like in 50 years' time. What do we need to think about. What their needs might be.

So Flint's response is to use storytelling because it's a method that's quite accessible to all of us. We all tell stories, we all read stories. Our nature is to tell stories. So it's an accessible method that everyone can use, whether they're literate or not, and they divided it into two different. So one was postcards to the future, which is quite a passive way of involving people so they can do it in their own time. You don't need to be there with them, but it's a way that they can express what they think through writing either to the future or back from the future to tell us what does that future look like. And in those stories, you can pick out where their concerns might be or where their hopes might be about how it's different.

And the other method that they used is character led storytelling and that's where the individuals would come together as a group, but each person would create a character that was in the future and then they build that future around the characters that they've all developed. So it's a really safe space and it's a way of putting some of your concerns on to a different character. So if there are different tensions in the room that need exploring, it's a really good way of doing that without posing that tension and kind of pointing fingers. So those are the two methods that we used for the project.

0:49:52.20 --> 0:50:10.610

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

The second part of the project that we really wanted to think about was whose voices aren't we hearing. And it's not necessarily that they don't have a voice, it's that we can't hear them. And we've kind of blurred the lines on these and we'll report it back as one group because actually there's intersectionality and all of this. It's not just young people or just people who already have experience. You might be a young person that has experience, or you might be a young farmer rather than simply a farmer or a young person.

But we worked with stakeholders to identify whose voices aren't we hearing loud enough. And those are the groups that we chose to go forward with. And then in the end, this was during the pandemic, so we had to be quite flexible in our approach, but we involved 142 people, so we worked with gatekeepers.

So I think that was a really important element for Flint was to work with people that already had that kind of trust with the individuals that we wanted to work with. So we did postcards for the future with young farmers and three schools, and then we did an exercise where we imagined the future

and what risks people saw in it with the character led storytelling workshops with these groups here so Tai Pawb and Hafod.

0:51:16.560 --> 0:51:17.370

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

What did we learn? So there were five key things that we took away from it. The first thing is that everything is connected and when you talk to people about climate change, what they were telling us was about their broad experience of the environment. Whether that was people not looking after their streets or wildfires in different countries.

So it was all connected and I think the learning for us in terms of how we work is that we need to keep joining the dots and if we want to speak to them in a way that resonates, we need the framing and the language that we use to be really engaging and to join those dots because that's how they think about it. Everything is connected. They're not seeing the wildfires and the disrespect of our very local as disconnected. The things they're seeing is a whole connected universe. So we need to reflect that in the way that we talk about some of the issues.

And we really found that people wanted to talk, but sometimes they were filling some of the gaps with their own misinformation and their concerns. So to avoid increasing that eco anxiety and especially with the more marginalised groups, we can work with representative organisations to not only work with them to understand what the issues are, but keep going back on that loop and coming back to them and saying this is how we're going to address it rather than just taking the information we want and developing policies or developing services, but keeping that communication going so that we're building agency with them rather than allowing them to fill that gap of knowledge with misinformation.

0:53:17.110 --> 0:53:28.520

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

We had this really nice thing where there was a lot of agencies in the room and there's that, as Alan said, people want to do things they're aware of it, but how do we support them? And people were really keen on taking action and coming together. There were a few different elements of this. And this was the first point about valuing existing expertise. There's a lot of expertise in communities. Financial constraints means that some members of deprived communities going if they have to live in a way that is more climate and nature friendly, how do we make the most of the knowledge that they have and also show them that we know, we're not preaching to the people that have already been converted.

And the second was how do we take down barriers. So a lot of them were saying they want to get together, but how do they get together in some communities that weren't community assets like libraries or pubs, that were accessible for people to come together. So how do we think about our local assets and how we can use them to support action?

And the third is providing helpful nudges. People want to do something. They're enthusiastic for change, but they don't know how always to translate that into action and Public Health Wales has published some behavioural sciences approaches guidelines that really support us to think about how can we help bridge that gap between intentions and actions and help them to do it and make it the easy choice for them because we know it's something that they want to do but it might not be something that they can do all the time.

0:55:0.500 --> 0:55:26.370

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

The other thing that we heard from a lot of people was the importance of green spaces for everyone and a real distrust in the green spaces that were around them and how much ownership they had then. And they were really worried that some of the green spaces would disappear because the land was wanted for other projects or initiatives. So how do we work with communities to prioritise keeping green spaces in their neighbourhoods?

And they wanted that to protect wildlife and provide opportunities for people to enjoy and exercise outdoors as well, and bearing in mind, this is very much tail end of COVID as well. So people were really very vocal about how much they wanted to keep their green spaces for their mental health and to bring people together. The way we might think about doing this is how do we involve communities in those decisions about the green spaces and how do we give them some ownership of those green spaces rather than have them feel that it doesn't belong to them so they don't use them as much as they possibly could.

And then the last thing we heard a lot about was transport as you might imagine. So the need for transport, and they split this into two elements, one was around a system that works for everyone. So there was a lot of concern about new ways of travelling and people using cars that have been adapted and being left behind by move to kind of electric and what does it mean for them. So it links as well a little bit to not leaving behind people in terms of communication and what different policies mean to different groups and that they don't fill this gap with misinformation.

0:56:56.670 --> 0:57:3.640

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

So really understanding transport from everybody's perspective and making sure that they're involved in those discussions. And then the second element was around making sure where when we're talking about public transport, that the public transport is fit for purpose and that it gets people to where they want to go. So if there's some social housing being built, how does the public transport connect it to schools or shops or those key community assets that we need to get to so that people aren't left behind in terms of needing to use vehicles instead of being able to use public transport where they can.

So those were the main findings that we had. But I also wanted to share some of the learnings from actually doing the project. So we split into a bit of a storyline as well. So in the beginning we were very keen to work in the five ways of working, so ensure it was a co-designed project. So we worked with stakeholders and community gatekeepers about which groups would be best suited to what methodology, and there was a lot of flexibility in it. So for some groups we split workshops into two workshops so that the time commitment wasn't one big lump. We also did some face to face and some online because we had to be quite flexible with COVID and actually to value their time as well and be really respectful of it and understand how we can work with them rather than make them work in a way that suited us.

0:58:37.340 --> 0:58:37.650

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

During the project we were adaptable throughout so when people's needs changed, we changed. We had quite unobtrusive record taking. So these pictures, we had an artist that came to the sessions or listened in with Flint and drew the records. So we had quite an interactive way of doing



it and a really good way then of linking to the end to debrief people on what they were involved in and to share a storybook and to share the stories that they came up with.

They also sketched the characters themselves. So the characters that people were coming up with, the artists drew those characters and the stories that came with them. So we have a resource that can be used by other projects as well. And we also did a lot of de-briefing and signposting at the end because it does bring things up that people might not be comfortable with or are feeling quite anxious about. So we had signposting to organisations that would be able to help them and if you would like to find out more, we have lots of different resources. So we've got the storybook itself which tells the stories that people shared and highlights some of the issues for policymakers and within that each of the characters that people created are in there. So if people wanted to do some involvement exercises but didn't have the time perhaps to develop the story or the characters and the worlds, those characters are ready to go and we could look at the characters and go, OK, what, what does this mean for this person. So you could look at some of the projections that Alan was talking about and look at the characters and think how would this person live under these circumstances. Because I think what Nerys said at the beginning was really interesting about it's not just about the projections, it's how do we live within that future.

1:0:35.540 --> 1:0:43.510

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

We also have some animations around futures and futures literacy, which tells you a bit more about the methods. And then we have all the tools and templates that we created available as well to make it easy if someone wants to pick it up and do something similar.

Thank you, diolch.

1:0:56.530 --> 1:0:56.920

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Diolch to you Sara. Thank you. That was absolutely fascinating to listen to and I'm really grateful for your time today and presenting it to us.

I think how we uplift the voices of people living in communities in terms of ensuring their voices are heard within the climate challenges is really crucial and I love the fact that you got out specifically to the young farmers and to some of those specific groups because I think as service providers, we can often have a view in our own heads about what the most important challenges are when we review the data and we see the reports. But actually what can be important to us can be quite different to what's important to people who are living in those towns and communities. And so the work that you've done really exemplifies the fact that it's of crucial importance to involve people, and people are interested, and they are engaged, and their time is important. And how we engage with them, we have to adapt ourselves to engaging with other people. And actually, we are those people. We are those people living in those communities. I think sometimes we can view it through a different lens, so really grateful for you sharing the work that has been conducted and the resources that you've got as well. Because I think having those particular resources available, people can pick it up and take it away and actually start to put that into action themselves in their own work. So diolch yn fawr iawn, really grateful. Thank you.

1:2:18.450 --> 1:2:24.520

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

So I'd like to introduce to you now, Holly Butterworth, who joins us from Natural Resources Wales. Holly is going to talk us through the draft local climate risk assessment framework, so over to you, Holly. Thank you again for your time and looking forward to your presentation. Yours is on show. I'll let you know when it's ready.

1:2:39.210 --> 1:2:40.220

Butterworth, Holly

Thank you so much. Rebecca, can you see my slides? Is that alright?

1:2:43.330 --> 1:2:44.430

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

We can absolutely.

1:2:44.710 --> 1:2:45.170

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

I just wanted to say I really enjoyed a Sarah's talk there. So interesting, really cool piece of work. I'm so pleased we've had such a good turn out today and so I want to share with you the work that we've been doing at Natural Resources Wales around climate change risk assessment for PSBs and the framework that we've been developing here.

So what I'm going to cover, we're going to look at why we've been developing this framework and who's been involved and who we've been collaborating with along the way. What the timeline is for this piece of work and then get into the practicalities of what is in the framework, and I think all the presentations that we've heard today have really kind of teased this out really nicely and hopefully you'll recognize a lot of the elements of what the other speakers have been speaking about in the framework that we've been developing.

1:3:40.540 --> 1:3:42.360

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

So first of all, why are we doing this? So this is actually a legislative requirement so you can see that little clipping there on the screen, which is a section from the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act, which actually shows that there is a statutory obligation for PSB's to take into account the UK climate change risk assessment that Alan was talking about earlier when they're preparing their wellbeing assessments.

So we found really that when we look through those wellbeing assessments, not all PSB's have taken account of this. In fact, barely any had and not in the way that would fulfil this requirement. So it was something that was picked up in the wellbeing planning stages, where each PSB has now, most of them have now committed to doing this local climate change risk assessment. So the motivation is there. It's really great that we've seen those all coming through in the plans and we're now in a position where PSB's are ready to do this work. I know that some PSB's have already started to do it and really, I think the PSB's are looking for guidance on how do you go about doing this climate change risk assessment, which is where this framework comes in.

1:4:52.520 --> 1:5:1.700

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

So we've developed it so that there is more of a national approach to how you carry out the climate change risk assessment and putting in place the support that's needed to do it. So I'll just go to the next slide here. Why have we come up with a new framework? So you'll probably be aware that

there are a lot of different methodologies, guidance's, frameworks out there around local climate risk assessment. We created a new one because we felt that we needed something that represented that really collaborative approach that the PSB's would be taking, and we wanted to draw on all that best practice that's already out there. The scope for this assessment is very much in the context of wellbeing, so it's looking at climate risk in the context of wellbeing in a PSB locality So it might be a bit different from what could have been done before in local authorities, in that it's taking a place-based wellbeing approach rather than a service based or an asset-based approach to looking at climate risk.

So who have been working on this? NRW has been leading on this, but it's been very much a collaborative effort and we've been working obviously with Public Health Wales and particularly closely with Nerys who you heard from earlier and also with Welsh Government and making sure that this really fits for example with their plans for adaptation strategy that's coming in the future and we've also been working with a lot of the other partners that you can see on this slide here. So for example, with the climate strategy panel through the WLGA with the future Gens Commission, the CJCS and with SDCC, and of course with the users of this framework, which will be the PSB practitioners of which, of course NRW is one.

1:6:43.10 --> 1:6:59.650

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

And so in terms of timeline and where we're at with the project, this is something that we started developing about six months or so ago and up to this point, we've been really working on developing the first draft of this framework. So it's very much in draft at the moment and part of what we're doing today is really sharing with you the work and where it's up to at this point and we're hoping that you can help us shape it and make sure that it's as fit for purpose as it can possibly be.

You can see from the dates there that first draft was produced a few weeks ago, and we're now in this kind of like feedback collaborative phase where we're building on that first draft and we're hoping to get a final approved draft out in the New Year, so it's quite ambitious, but fingers crossed that will be possible.

So that's a bit of background and now just to get into practically what the framework is and the steps that are in it, I'm going to talk you through this and go through each step in a bit more detail.

The first step is plan your approach and the next step is to consider past and present climate impacts and step three looking ahead, so this is the one that's really about the future climate risk and starting to talk about that, and step four risk prioritization and step five iteration, so I'll go into a bit of detail on each of those now.

1:8:10.980 --> 1:8:25.530

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

So your first one, this is all about planning your approach, so it's getting everything ready to start this piece of work and I just want to highlight again something that was spoken about in the previous presentation, which is really making sure that you're doing this in the spirit of the five ways of working. Obviously, that runs through everything we do, and this would be no different.

So the first thing you want to do is establish governance, Alan touched on this. It may be that there are existing structures in place, like say, a PSB subgroup that would suit really nicely for guiding this

piece of work, but you want to consider who's going to enable the action that might come from the adaptation strategy that will come from the climate risk assessment and consider how that governance structure might look.

You're going to want a project lead and a team that will kind of run the project and you'll see when you do get a copy of the draft framework, you'll see that under each step we've highlighted, which skills are required for each step, so it's helpful when you're building your team to make sure that you've got those skills within your team or that you can kind of outsource them if you don't have them. We would recommend stakeholder mapping at this point and also getting the message out there and considering what's already happening within the PSB location in terms of existing climate risk assessments or adaptation strategies and also planning evaluation and planning your methodology.

So in terms of what the framework looked like, it's like a Word document that sets out each of these five steps and has a description of what they are. And there's also an Excel workbook that sits beside it and the idea is that you can read through the framework and then fill out the Excel workbook and to make sure that you've hit every step and it has some quite helpful things in it. So for example, when you're doing your stakeholder mapping, the workbook will have examples of the type of stakeholders that you might want to involve and that's the case for each of the steps as you go through.

1:10:19.870 --> 1:10:24.640

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

So Step 2, consider past and present climate impacts. So once you've got your team in place, this is likely something that you'll want to do in like a workshop setting. So once you've got your team there, you want to come together and reflect on past and current weather events and how they've impacted communities within your PSB area. So this is a picture of I think it's from two years ago. This is Storm Dennis and photo obviously shows some really severe flooding during that time, so that those initial conversations will help people get in the space of thinking about climate risk through lived experience and bringing in those risks from the 61-risk list from that UK climate change risk assessment report and that kind of provides a bit of guidance on all the types of risks that you want to be looking at.

So after this we have to step three. So this is where you'll be looking ahead, and this is the one that's really about talking about future climate risks. So this is the kind of real meat of the process. On the left there you can see that climate change risk assessment report, that's the UK wider report and in the table, you can see some examples of those 61 risks that are within that report that you'll want to be discussing and exploring during this process. There are 61 risks in there and it's a lot. So what we're actually recommending is that rather than going through each risk in detail, you would initially there will be short listed by the PSB for ones that are particularly relevant to wellbeing within that locality, and it may be that some aren't so relevant. So for example, there's a category on international risks that one probably wouldn't feel that you need to go into detail on.

So within this step you would want to be having a better understanding of how climate is expected to change in the future by looking at evidence of climate variable projections within that locality. You also want to be understanding who is most vulnerable to climate change by looking at local evidence

of population vulnerability and that very much goes back to what Nerys was going into detail about in her presentation around vulnerable population groups and the types of factors that will make people more vulnerable, such as age, disability, etc.

1:12:45.770 --> 1:12:55.570

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

And then finally, you want to look at how that changing climate is likely to impact wellbeing within your locality and using those risks from the risk list as a guide for that. And so just to go into a bit more detail on this, you can see that propeller diagram at the bottom. These are like the four dimensions of risk that you use to calculate what level of risk is posed by any particular risk area. So again, Nerys talked about this in her presentation, but I will just recap it for you.

I don't know if you can see that on the screen there, but there are four different dimensions. We've got hazard, vulnerability, exposure and response. So the hazard is like the weather or the climate event that might have the adverse effect, so for example, that could be like a heat wave, or it could be a flood or something like that. We are actually going to have a go at this in the discussions later on. Exposure is the likelihood of the people or the things like property or infrastructure, the likelihood that it will be exposed to that hazard so that can be quite a spatial dimension. You want to be looking at things like flood risk maps, for example, to assess the level of exposure and vulnerability. We've gone into a bit of detail already, but this is the likelihood of those people or things to suffer adverse effects from the hazard and the response is adaptation measures that are already in place. So for example, having air conditioning in a building would be a response to mitigate the effects of heat wave or maybe it would be something like flood defences that are already in place.

So there's a lot there in terms of how you assess that level of risk, we've done quite a lot of work in feeding into this framework to say what type of evidence we recommend people are looking at. And you can see some examples on the screen here of the types of evidence that we're recommending. So unfortunately there isn't like a really nice data platform that has everything in it, that would be great, but it looks like probably be using a couple of different platforms. So on the left there, that's one example, you can see there's Data Map Wales that's showing flood risk from river and sea flooding around the Cardiff area and another platform we recommend is Climate Just, you can see that one in the top right and that's showing some data around vulnerability to flood based on age for example, and then of course we've got the health impact assessment report and the 10 population groups within that Nerys spoke about.

Another piece of evidence that you'll want to be drawing on is your wellbeing risk assessment. If you're in a PSB, that's done a lot of this work, particularly around population groups that you will be able to draw on. So you'll find all of this in that draft framework, particularly in the appendices and it goes right into the level of detail on which data layers you'd want to use in different data platforms.

1:15:52.30 --> 1:15:54.200

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

So that's Step 3. From there you will end up with a list of risks in order of what is felt to be most important within the PSB. So this table here is showing a three-point scale. We've actually had some feedback and decided it would be a four-point scale, so apologies, this is out of date, but you can see

how the level of exposure and vulnerability can kind of form the level of risk that you would see from and the risks you have been discussing.

So I think it's also really important to consider at this point what is in the influence of the PSB? So a lot of the risks that we identified will require adaptation actions that actually sit outside the control of the PSB. So what we want to be discussing at this point, how are those risks going to be addressed and where can the assessment be shared so that it will have the maximum impact that it can have and result in the action that you want to see.

With those risks that we identified as most important, you can also go into another layer of detail on that and identify specific communities or population groups that are vulnerable to those risks and then use that information to pinpoint spatial hotspots and priority settings or population groups where adaptation should be prioritized. So at the end of this whole process, you can see that you will be in a really good position to then go forward and fulfil a local climate adaptation strategy, which is where all that action takes place and that is the really important next step. So this draft guidance, it doesn't tell you how to go and do an adaptation strategy, but it will get PSB in the best possible position to be able to go and do that piece of work.

1:17:48.710 --> 1:17:51.680

Butterworth, Holly (Natural Resources Wales)

So the fifth and final step is iteration. This is basically there because we want to make it really clear that there shouldn't be a one-off exercise as circumstances change. That might be new evidence comes to light or big decisions being made, but the assessment may need to be renewed, and obviously, because it's got that statutory link, ideally this should be done with each wellbeing assessment cycle. I know it's a bit out of sync at the moment with the current cycle, but ideally this would be on that kind of like 5-year renewal with those wellbeing assessments.

So I think that's it from me and just wanted to say this links with the workshops that we've got on later this afternoon and that's an opportunity to really get some great feedback from you that can help us shape this and make sure that it's as a robust product as it can be, so really encourage you to participate in that. If you are based in a PSB or within a locality, I would really recommend giving feedback through our individual PSB practitioners in each place. I think my colleague James will just post in the chat who would be best to contact for each locality. Or, if you're a national partner, we would very much like to hear your feedback too, but we'll give you my email address to give that national feedback to. And brilliant, I think we aren't taking questions now, but are very open to questions in the chat or once it finished. Thank you.

1:19:25.980 --> 1:19:26.990

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Thanks so much Holly. That was super helpful, and I think again it kind of goes back to that practical how do we support people actually do the thing that we need them to do, and I think you've provided a really helpful example of that.

We are absolutely bang on time for once in my life so please everybody go take 10 minutes, have a brew and come back at 11:00 o'clock and we will jump straight into the Q&A session.

1:21:40 Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Hi everybody I hope you are all enjoyed that quick comfort break and got yourself a brew so settle in, and we are going to go straight into a Q&A session for the speakers that we've had previously. We've got 15 minutes for the Q&A and then we're going to go straight into a bigger presentation by Meilys from Gwynedd Local Authority, who's going to talk us through her work around the Fairbourne community and the health impact assessment with the community there. But that includes a Q&A, especially for Meilys, she gets her own one.

So without further ado, can I ask all of the previous speakers to pop their cameras on and we will jump straight into the Q&A. You never really know if you are just talking to yourself on these things, so it's always grateful when other people turn their cameras on.

Have we got Nerys and Alan? They're probably still working their way back from, OK Alan doesn't have access to mic and camera again, is anybody able to change Alan's role from attendee? No idea how to do that Alan sorry, oh, brilliant, fab, glad you could join us.

Nerys are you able to join us or are you still getting a brew? My first question was to Nerys, but we'll jump and go to the second one, so give me one sec.

OK so we've we had one from Chris Long, which was directly for Nerys, but until she's joined us, I'll go straight to the second one, which was from Stuart Bourne one my public health colleagues. So Stuart's question was climate change feels like it's another syndemic i.e. interacting with an exacerbating existing inequality. How can we bring together climate inequalities risk assessment into a single approach? That is a really good question Stuart, is anybody able to pick that one up?

1:24:02.

Dr. Alan Netherwood

Can I come in there, Rebecca?

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Please do.

Dr. Alan Netherwood

We've had decades of impact assessments, haven't we, one type or another and we kind of focus on a service or a strategy. I mean, this isn't about putting climate risk above everything else and as Stuart says, you know, climate risk interacts with all the services that we're delivering really. So I guess I'm empathising with Stuart, but it it's about doing something that's proportionate. The worry I have is that we all go off and you know, or you all go off and commission pieces of work and a terrible phrase, will disappear up our own backsides gathering data with actually not applying that data to service reform and planning services going forward. So my response to Stewart is do something proportionate. We're very good at thinking forward on service delivery in economic terms or in terms of using population assessments and demographics to think about stuff, this is just about adding climate risk into the mix. Don't know whether that's answered your question, Stuart, but I absolutely get where you're coming from.

1:25:23

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yeah, I would share those views, absolutely. If we kind of think back to the COVID 19 pandemic, it very much feels like it's certainly on that scale of the challenge in terms of the scale of the response that's required, but also the fact that it permeates every single aspect of the lives that we lead and there's no getting away from it. And it's how we ensure that we have, from a Public Health Wales perspective, how we ensure that this becomes everybody's business in terms of service delivery and planning and adaptation. This has to be something that's intrinsic to everybody's work. It's not an addition to, it's an intrinsic like what you were referring to Alan earlier about the running through the Blackpool rock, it's central to kind of that delivery aspect. I would agree with Stuart in the sense viewing it from that kind of syndemic perspective, absolutely.

1:26:16

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Nerys, great you could join us again for the Q&A session. We've got a question from Chris Long which is addressed to you directly. So thank you for supporting the HIA training at Bridgend College. Is there a role for Public Health Wales to further support health impact assessment within the education sector to support more resilient learners and do public health Wales have the resources to this? If not, how can education best do this?

1:26:37

Nerys S. Edmonds

Thanks for your question, Chris. I've been to Bridgend College working with you before on our HIA training so it's nice to see you here today. I think the Wales HIA support unit is about to restart our health impact assessment training program. We'll be doing that in the New Year and that will be something that's accessible to all organisations across Wales.

We're a small team as you know, we're not going to be able to come and do health impact assessments, but we will be able to provide training and guidance for the education sector and obviously the health impact assessment of climate change will be there to help people think about what climate change specifically means for health and wellbeing in the educational settings. Whether that's how it's generally impacting staff and students, but also how college life or the college environment, whether it's the buildings or other aspects of the environment is impacting on the health and wellbeing, so I suppose the short answer is yes.

1:27:49

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

We'll take a short answer because we've only got a few minutes left with the Q&A, so we've really got 11 minutes left, but I want to make sure that we get through all the questions so short answers are excellent. Thank you, Nerys.

And we've got another question from Andrew Kemp. So, hi, thank you so much for organising the event. He's reflecting on something that Alan has said about people getting it, and that now we have the leadership and processes to facilitate local climate action. He was wondering if the experience of those on the ground driving succession has been in terms of pushback by vested interests. So driving delay and inaction, so have people working in the climate field felt much of that pushback from those with vested interests.



1:28:27

Dr. Alan Netherwood

I'm happy to go first on that. Yeah, institutional inertia. You know, this is asking questions of institutions that made them feel uncomfortable. They may not have all of the answers and I think that puts certain managers and people leading on stuff in a very difficult place, personally, as a personal leader.

So I think the pushback for me has always been well, we've got all of this sorted, we have our heat wave action plan, we have our flood risk management plan. We know what's going to happen up to 2050 or it's in our corporate plan. And to me, that's kind of OK what does that actually mean? And I think you know two examples I'd use are Western Power Distribution and Dwr Cymru because you know, doing local work, you're thinking about resilience of water systems and energy systems?

The initial response will always be well, we've got a commitment to climate change and it's kind of about net zero. Of course, we plan forward for this in our maintenance operations. I would encourage you to ask how? So Western Power Distribution do all of this stuff on the overhead lines, you know they're all over the overhead lines, but the energy kit along the roads that will get undermined by climate change that your services rely on aren't part of that discourse at the moment.

So I think this is about PSB's bringing Dwr Cymru and others in and saying you know, how are you planning forward for climate risk? Don't give me your corporate bumph. How are you planning for climate risk in Llangollen or Rhyl? So long answer, but it's about taking leaders, getting past the corporate bumph.

1:30:39

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

And asking those difficult questions and actually as a corporate leader responding to those difficult questions and not shying away from them. I say that as a corporate leader. Nerys, do you want to come in?

1:30:49

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales)

I just wanted to come in on this bit. I think Andrew's comment in the chat also mentioned about misinformation and I think that's a really important prompt to highlight something I mentioned in my presentation, which is about risk communication and having a really clear and transparent communication plan around the assessment of local climate risk and why it's important to involve communities because I think we need information that people can understand and digest recognising that a lot of climate projections, and there's a lot of uncertainty that sits behind some of those projections, we're presenting that in a way that's clear, understandable and transparent and that we're in dialogue with communities about that. So I think having a communications plan but also having a well-developed approach to communicate risk is really, really important both for sort of trust but also for managing people's anxiety about these things. Thanks.

1:31:53

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yeah, absolutely. Thank you. I was going through the questions in order, and Alan I noticed you'd asked one about NRW's involvement in terms of the PSB's and how they're able to support and I can see that Fen and colleagues have responded to some of that in the chat, but did you want to use this opportunity to raise that question yourself? Oh, you're on mute, and I'm really conscious that we've only got Holly online and Holly's probably not going to be able to answer that question, but please do use this as a platform if you want to speak to it.

1:32:25

Dr. Alan Netherwood

It's a bit mischievous, a bit tongue in cheek, but you know, I kind of wonder why we're getting more guidance when risk assessments need to be carried out. And I get you need a framework for the risk assessment, but you know picking up on Hazel's comment in the chat, who's going to do this? You know who's going to lead on this and actually use this methodology? It's great that you're producing it, but if capacity is an issue, you know picking up on the point I was making, how do we organise ourselves around this complex problem? So I wanted to add that question, that's all.

1:33:03

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

No, fair enough. Absolutely, and Holly, I don't expect you to come in and respond to that unless you would like to.

1:33:10

Butterworth, Holly

Yeah, I can add to that. I think Fen and Gavin have put some good responses in the chat, which are hopefully helpful. I just wanted to pick up on what you were talking about Alan about secondments and I just wanted to kind of emphasise something that Fen was saying about what we're also trying to do with this framework is to build capacity and capability within each of the PSB organisations of which obviously NRW is one and I find that you know, with something like in a fixed term role, sometimes all of that skill and knowledge can be lost when that person leaves. So I think we probably want to avoid that kind of structure. But yes, I can definitely appreciate that the resource is really difficult for everyone, and I would sort of emphasise NRW's role in helping coordinate the framework and obviously helping with the delivery side too.

1:34:01

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Thanks Holly. Nerys did you want to come in?

1:34:04

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales)

Yes, I think for me it's about highlighting the shared responsibility of managing and responding to climate risk in a particular place and I guess the ambition that there's a shared ownership around this risk assessment because it is being delivered through the PSB structure. I recognise that's a

challenge, you know, I've been working on the climate change HIA, I know how much work this type of assessment takes, so I'm not naive about that. But I also think we need to reorientate resources to responding to climate change so this presents an opportunity to start to do that and to start to do that collective thinking but also recognising how limited resources are, we all know this will be a challenge, but it's an important one as well.

1:34:57

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

I would agree with that and it's for me as a system, as a corporate leader, I think it's about moving away from talking and researching and evaluating. Well not evaluating, but a move towards action. Actually, how do we just take well defined action with meaning on the ground in the communities that we live and work with, and I think it's about the need to support that within that PSB structure so that we can provide support, practical support that's needed.

Alan, do you want to come back in?

1:35:29

Dr. Alan Netherwood

Yeah, it's true. I've got a lot of hope here. I think it's a really good framework being developed. My worry is we go down a technocratic route for the next four years of the PSB and we end up with 13 risk assessments and it's like so what? I think for me this is about leadership. So the tool is the means to an end to produce the assessment. It's what happens after the assessment that's the really interesting bit.

1:36:03

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

I found your comment earlier about people being surprised that they had to take action at the end of the development of the of the piece of work. Oh gosh, we've actually got to do something now and I think that's quite an intrinsic part, isn't it? It's like this is a means to an end. There will be things that you have to do at the end of this and you are required to acknowledge them and resource them and do them fundamentally and ensure that they're working. Yeah, I think that's something we can all agree to. Absolutely.

We have got time. I'm going to go for two more questions before we go over to Meilys. So I've got one for Sara. So, Sara, the question we've got from Suzanne, who is listening online, oh, which has just moved now that I've moved my screen. So Sara, what did local communities want the long-term engagement to look like and feel like and be like, so the gap is not there, and misinformation doesn't grow.

1:36:49

Sara Elias (Public Health Wales - No. 2 Capital Quarter)

Thanks. I don't think we explored it with the participants in terms of what the solution would be. We were very much focused on what were the concerns and identify, so what, that's something that came out of the analysis, was looking at actually there's a gap here in that we're not getting back to people and they're filling that gap with anxiety. So it's one of our recommendations rather than

something a solution that the participants came back with. But what I would say is it depends a little bit on what people are saying and what groups you're looking at. So it's about identifying which groups are going to be impacted. How might they be impacted and understanding that how by involving them and then thinking what's our best communication group back to them. It may not be, a Council newsletter may not be the best way if you're very, if there's a very specific group, then it's about who does that group work with and working with those gatekeepers to reach them and make making sure that they're kept in the loop, not just that you hear their concerns, and you'll take it away and deal with it. It's hearing those concerns and telling them this is what we're going to do about it. Or if there's a UK policy, how might that affect them if they're worried about it and tailoring that information to specific groups that might have different needs. I hope that helps.

1:38:21

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Brilliant. Thank you, Sara. And I'm going to end with a practical one that's come in from Helen Hammond, who asks who was involved with WLGA leadership group that we can link into. So I think this is one for you, Alan. This is a group that you mentioned earlier in some leadership work that you were doing with WLGA.

1:38:38

Dr. Alan Netherwood

Yeah. Yeah, it's Doctor Tim Peppin who's the head of region that some of you may know. He and I have been working together on this leadership program. But he sits on a Welsh Government Local Government panel at a national level, which is looking at climate risk. And I'm not sure whether PHW are involved in that. Guy might be able to tell me that, but you know, that's the kind of strategic level where, you know, public bodies ought to be coming together. But it's a frustration, you know, for me that the WLGA leadership stuff we've been doing for 18 months, other parts of the public sector should be able to see it. But you know we're kind of hamstrung. So this isn't about me getting more work. You know the materials there. There's a library of material there that other public bodies you know may find useful. So I think tackling that at the panel level or at a senior level, might be a good idea.

1:39:44

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yeah, absolutely. Thank you. I think that's one that we can pick up in the background. It would be helpful to share some information and see how we can progress that. Thank you, Alan and thanks Helen that was a really helpful question. So thank you all to the panel members. You are relieved of your panel duties, and we are going to pass over to Meilys Smith who is going to talk us through the work that she has been undertaking in Gwynedd County Council, which is around involving local perspectives on climate adaptation learning from the health impact assessment with the community of Fairbourne in Gwynedd.

So welcome Meilys. Really excited to hear your presentation especially those of us that live and work up in the north of Wales, be well aware of the work that's been undertaken in Gwynedd, and I think it's a really helpful example to share of how some of the challenges we have around climate change.

Is Meilys on the line? Do we know? She was here. You're on mute, Nerys. But I'm getting a sense of what you're saying.

1:40:46

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

Sorry, I think Meilys is here, but I think she may have joined on an attendee link not back on the presenter link. I don't know if Network colleagues, you can switch her over or if, I've just emailed you Meilys the presenter link.

1:41:03

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Here she is. Thanks Nerys.

1:41:07

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Sorry. Can you hear me now?

1:41:09

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yes, we can, absolutely. Brilliant

1:41:12

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Should I go ahead and share my presentation?

1:41:15

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Please do.

1:41:16

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Brilliant. Hi everybody and it's great to be here. I hope some of this is going to be valuable to you. I'll just get my view as it should be. I hope you can see a single slide now on the screen. Brilliant, thank you very much.

OK. Thank you very much. So I'm senior manager supporting health and wellbeing at Cyngor Gwynedd, and I came into Fairbourne moving forward project fairly recently. It's only been 18 or 24 months now, but I'm just going to talk quite honestly about my experience of being pulled into that project and the work and that we've done with the community in Fairbourne.

1:42:07

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

In case you don't know, this is Fairbourne on the map in South Gwynedd, and here's a picture. You can see the village in the distance there, an absolutely beautiful part of the world. Not too far from Barmouth, quite close to Harlech, so that gives you an idea where Fairbourne is.

To give you just a little bit more of an idea of the sort of community we've been working with, there's about 700 permanent residents living there. They're quite difficult to estimate the actual numbers during the summer months, many second homes, holiday homes, static caravans, that sort of thing. But that gives you just an idea. And 83% of residents own their homes. They've bought them, they've paid off the mortgages. Over 55-year-olds, a very large proportion unsurprisingly. A lot of the residents are people who were coming on holiday to Fairbourne for many years and decided to retire in the area. And as you can imagine from a health and well-being perspective that does bring about its own set of circumstances and issues for us to consider.

And there's risk of flooding to 461 properties, that was the last count and as somebody previously mentioned there is an awful lot of data out there. I haven't had to do any of that, thankfully, and it's something I would not be able to do within my skill set, but the data is there, and it's constantly being reviewed and updated but at the time we started this HIA process. That gives you an idea of the level of risk and to properties in the community.

So what is a health impact assessment? I've given you a link there to the Wales Health Impact Assessment Support Unit's website, which explains far better than I ever could. There's a lot of resource on that website and I would encourage anybody who's thinking of embarking on an HIA to go in there and have a read. There's loads of stuff there and I found the support that Nerys has personally given us as a team to be invaluable throughout the process. There is definition here, which basically says it's a process of bringing together different types of evidence. Working with stakeholders locally and then understanding the issues and working through those to see how we can see what the effects are on health and well-being, but also take that step forward, how we can help the community to respond to what we learn jointly.

So for the purpose of this process, I thought it was really important to explain how we look at health and well-being. And it's a very, very broad description or definition. So it's to do with physical health, mental health, but also general well-being, to what extent are we feeling good in ourselves. Are we able to function well to cope well in our day to day lives? So the health impact assessment has looked at that broad range of factors when it comes to health and well-being.

There are three things that help all of us with our mental well-being in general terms, and we've given a lot of thought to these three aspects when we've been designing the health impact assessment process, speaking to people and thinking about the future. And the first one is feeling that you have a sense of control. And when I became involved with the project in Fairbourne it very, very quickly became apparent that the community there didn't feel a sense of control. And they felt that there was a project board with many statutory organisations around the table, but the community did feel as if they were being talked at, as if others were making decisions, as if they were getting information and data, but that it was a little bit after everybody else. So there was definitely a lack of trust between statutory organisations involved and the community itself. And that's something that we've had to invest an awful lot of time and energy in. And that's something

I'd say to anybody is the sooner you can start to build a relationship with the community and coproduce with the community then it will be the better for everybody.

1:46:41

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

The second aspect is participation. So including people, and this links in with the first one, including as many parts of the community as possible. In our experience, it's been relatively easy to work with the Community Council and with committees who already do a lot of Community work. It's not so easy to tap into people in the community who don't generally want to be involved in developments or in public sort of meetings, or that kind of thing. They just want to sit back and enjoy their life in the community, which is fair enough, but it is really important to try and get everybody's participation. And all of us do feel that we want support when we need it. We want to be left alone in general when we don't need formal support from an external organisation or statutory body. But when we need support, we need that to be there and very accessible for us. So we've kept this in mind throughout the whole process.

The context for the work that I became involved in was that there was a project board called Fairbourne Moving Forward Project Board and had many, many different organisations and teams presents on that board. So for example, parts of Cyngor Gwynedd. So we had the Consultancy and Highways team there. So very technical viewpoint there. We had the National Resources Wales, Transport for Wales and similar organisations alongside the Community Council members representing Fairbourne. But that project board had been going for approximately 10 years before somebody thought that we really should have a fifth working group which was looking very specifically around people issues and physical and mental well-being issues. So a fifth working group was established about 18 months ago and the other working groups were around things such as the technical infrastructure and the economic sustainability of the Community and those sorts of issues. But nobody up to this point had actually thought well, we really need to be working with the community around their health and well-being. And nobody had really recognised the importance of that in moving forward. That was a really positive step in the project.

1:49:11

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

And myself from Cyngor Gwynedd, so I work with the supporting health and wellbeing team and our mantra is we want to support people to have a good life in their community, whether that's a community under threat because of climate change or any on anything else. We just want to work with communities and also Dafydd Gwynne a colleague who couldn't be with me today but he's from Public Health Wales and now established within Betsi Cadwaladr University Health Board. So Dafydd and I work alongside to try and lead this workstream and Nerys as I mentioned has given us an awful lot of support as well. So that additional capacity with this background in people's well-being has been invaluable.

Welsh Government or more specifically the Flood Risk Team at Welsh Government funded a health impact assessment or funded a piece of work I should say. And we decided jointly with the Community to undertake a health impact assessment and that was about £40,000. Looking back, I don't think it was quite enough. We should have negotiated maybe for the little bit more. It has been challenging to complete the work, to do all the preparatory work, the whole health impact assessment process, all the feedback to the community and some planning within that amount of money. But it just gives you a ballpark.

1:50:32

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Welsh Government had an expectation tag alongside that £40,000 funding that we would prepare an outline business case. It's interesting where we've ended up and I'll talk a little bit about that. I think there was an assumption from both sides, Welsh Government and us as a project team that there would be some kind of solution or idea relating to trying to prevent risk or reduce risk of climate risk to the future that would end up in a quite formal business case. And the findings mean that actually the things we want to work with, the things the community want to achieve aren't really to do with solutions that might reduce the risk they are more to do with other factors which I'll talk about.

The process in summary is this, so we did go out to tender, I should have said that. We got one company coming back with a submission which is interesting in itself. Not an awful lot of companies out there who are used to undertaking health impact assessments who wanted the challenge I assume. Better classification explaining what we wanted out of the process, I think one of the first important things to do with the health impact assessment is to be very, very clear what you actually want to impact assess. So be very clear and precise. It's not a general and fact-finding exercise around people's well-being. It's there to impact assess something specific and that was one of the elements Nerys helped us to get our heads clear about. So this was specific to do with trying to assess the impact of living with the threat of climate change and flooding mainly in this instance.

1:52:41

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

So the process entailed doing a big desktop exercise, looking at all sorts of data, figures, some of that data to do with climate change particularly, and things like sea level rise. But a lot of the data to do with demographics, age, medical issues within that population. Then we worked hard jointly with Savills, the company we commissioned to pull together a resident's questionnaire, which was delivered to every single household in Fairbourne. Then we had a series of public engagement sessions so people could drop in or they could ask for a one-to-one interview and over the course of about three or four days while the project team and Savills themselves were there, we saw more and more, and more people turn up which was a very positive thing. As with most of these things and the overall percentage of people who spoke to the team was relatively small but I think there was a quality in those discussions and I think the value of the skills of the interviewing team, the way they could conduct conversations in a way that helped people open up, not feel as if they had to be too defensive or too agitated, that they were having open conversations, quite relaxed feels to those conversations that I witnessed and that skill set to be able to talk and listen and we're crucial.

Then at the end of all of that engagement and having collated all the data and the questionnaires, there was a summarising of key findings, drafting of the reports, pulling together conclusions, deciding how to summarise those conclusions and preparation of the final report and executive summary. And those are publicly available if anybody is interested.

In terms of how we went about the governance, I mentioned the project board. The project board gave it some direction, expected this of the people work stream. But also it was reporting to Welsh Government regularly due to the fact that it was funded by Welsh Governments and an awful lot of interest in the findings. And I think there was an element in Fairbourne or feeling that this could be a learning exercise for future health impact assessments elsewhere.



1:55:05

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

So the people work group then consisted of different organisations, Public Health Wales, Cyngor Gwynedd, but very importantly we had the Chair who was a member of the Community Council, and she led the work. She fronted the work and then we had people from the Health Board and other organisation supporting us on that group. Savills, as I mentioned, was commissioned and then the Health Impact Assessment Support Unit supporting the work.

So I've grouped the key findings here. The major finding was around the importance of communication, sharing of timely information, having the right mechanisms for communications and having an open channel between the Community and statutory bodies and that was shared with us in many guises. But that was a huge, huge theme coming out and we have recognised the need for dedicated communications and resource to support the community and work with the community.

Then there with things around just protecting the community in the short term. So very simple things a lot of them. Such as places to store sandbags for instance, they don't have that within the community. So I think we went in assuming that the ideas would be huge, very costly and that they would take lots of time to sort out. But actually lots of them were quite simple ideas, and the community itself was able to generate a lot of ideas. But what we found was that there hadn't really been a mechanism where those ideas could become, they could be discussed and there wasn't any support maybe for going out and trying to get some funding to make some of these things of reality.

And then an awful lot of ideas and willingness and eagerness within the community to develop projects which are to do with the sustainability and the prosperity of the community, while it is existing. So we don't know for sure obviously for how long Fairbourne is going to be existing or how Fairbourne in its current state is going to be existing. But the community, and I was relatively surprised, was very, very keen to make sure that there was support for the economy and that there was some developmental projects there to bring more tourists in, to support more people to live well within that community, but also lots of creativity in the ideas about how they could combine ideas for tourism with some structures, technical structures that might support the draining of water, for instance. So creating a pond for people to come and relax in the community whilst also making use of an old brickwork and help to drain water from the land was one of the ideas so that kind of thing.

1:58:10

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

And then there were ideas around planning for the future. The community very, very active in wanting to make sure that they could live with the community, visit the community for as long as possible, but also tied in with that recognising that the emergency planning activities to date were very weak and very happy to share with statutory bodies what we could do more of and to be more specific about how we'd respond in very specific circumstances. And so that also came to the fore. I've given the email address of our project manager for the overall project here, Llion. So you're more than welcome to contact Llion and ask for a copy of the report or get in touch with me and ask for more details.

So the next steps for us in Fairbourne is that we want to pull together the finding from the report and pull together an action plan. So some work has already started to try and take advantage of some grants funding that's available through Prosperity fund, accessibility, that sort of thing. But we

want to work with the community and we're trying to think of ways forward and the type of group that is best placed to work on the action plan and to have a delivery plan and to move some ideas forward.

1:59:48

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

I must be honest in that it's been quite challenging to find a way that everybody feels comfortable with around supporting the community. I think as a team we assumed the community would want to lead and just pull us in as Council Officers and other organisations officers as and when, but they wanted to lead. But very much in Fairbourne the feeling is that, no, they want us to have quite formal project arrangements in place I think because of the lack of trust in the past, they feel that gives them some security, some assurance that we will actually turn up very regularly.

So that might not be the same everywhere, but we are trying to find a way of helping the community to support itself and to feel that it has got some of that control and it's regaining some of the control that maybe it feels it's lost. And we do want to implement together, and I should say at this point that a lot of the ideas coming out from the community and some of the feelings and some of the things that affect health and well-being have got nothing to do with the risk of climate change. Some of them are to do with the reality, if you like, of living in a very rural community in Gwynedd where hospitals and other health services or social care services, are either very scarce or they're very, very far from where you are and travel networks are poor, that sort of thing which are common in all sorts of communities. And in my mind, we shouldn't be focusing solely on the things that are just there because of the risk of climate change, because people are people and our feelings are our feelings, regardless of what's impacting on those feelings and impacting on our wellbeing. So we want to try and be broad in our approach without losing the learning around the risk of climate change.

So very, very quickly these are the key points that came to my mind when I was thinking about the learning. So the first thing is not to make any assumptions. I was assuming that most people in Fairbourne would be very, very supportive of this process, that they were desperate for someone to speak to them because of their concerns and that they were being kept awake at night worrying about climate change. And that's not what we saw. We saw many people asking the question why Fairbourne? Why are you here? There's loads of places in Wales with the same level of risk. Why are you bothering us? And that came up an awful lot of time. And there might have been a little bit of denial, which is a natural human response. But it was quite a different response to the one I expected at the onset and that took a little bit of relationship building before we even got started.

I've talked about trust. I'd say to anybody around the table, it's much easier to build trust than to try and rebuild it once it's lost, which is what we've had to try and deal with. Including children and young people has been a big headache and a challenge for us. I've got three quite young kids myself, or teenagers, and I can imagine if they lived in an area where there was significant risk that they would be very, very worried and they couldn't make sense maybe of the data or the messaging, so we have struggled with this one, but I'm pleased to say we're having some positive conversations with Education Department colleagues. But I think to give a lot of thought and collaboration with educational establishments about how to present these ideas and facts to young children from a very young age so that they are aware, they do know what the future might hold, and it's done in a very sensitive way.

2:03:34

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

In general, communities in Gwynedd don't really have a lot of respect towards public bodies, especially in Fairbourne. So again, we need to go in knowing that and building the trust slowly. It doesn't happen overnight. People do deny the truth and I think that's the reason may be why I was slightly surprised by some of the views. Also the conversations I had with people who are thinking, why are you here? Why are you wasting your time coming to our community? Not everybody, but that was the general feeling. As I've said at the onset, I think we went in there thinking that we'd have lots of ideas about structural changes possibly or changes to properties or that kind of thing that could help people reduce the risk to themselves. But on the whole, and this is linked to the fact that people very often were trying not to think about the climate change risk, was that there were many other things that they were more concerned about than climate change. And once you've heard it, you've can't unhear and I feel we've got a responsibility to work with our partners in health, social care, all the other partner organisations which would feed into the PSB to try and make people's lives better in general.

Data, we could have done with better data. We could have done with more varied data, and I think it's worth just thinking a lot about the data that you have for a particular community because Fairbourne, in the sense that we think of Fairbourne, doesn't fit nicely into an LSOA (Local Super Output Area) boundary. So to give quite a bit of thought to the data is quite important because I think at the end of the day, the data that we did generate during the HIA process didn't tell us an awful lot. It gave us some indications but didn't tell us an awful lot. So worth thinking about. And final thought for me is that co-producing with the communities isn't something you can do overnight. Definitely in the short few months I've been involved, it hasn't been possible in total, I'm getting there. One of the community members and the Community Council asked me one day would I like to go camping with my kids in Fairbourne and I thought we're turning a corner here but building that relationship is challenging and it takes a lot of effort.

And so some parting photos from me. These are my three kids, preens and teens in Fairbourne this summer and that's just to highlight really how wonderful the community is, how lovely it is and also how important it is to show to the community that you are genuinely interested. That you want to be part of their community and have a little bit of experience of their day-to-day life and the resources that they're enjoying. Thank you very much.

2:06:34.

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Thank you Meilys, that was absolutely fascinating and thank you personally for sharing that information. Sharing the work with us and providing a spotlight on work that's gone on in Fairbourne. And coming from a community that was under threat of decampment myself, not through climate change and seeing the impact that doing that badly can have on a community, it's really important that we learn from how we've done things in the past. No, this wasn't in Wales. To ensure that we can make better decisions with community members and that involvement. And I think the point that you made about we go into things with preconceived ideas, don't we as officers into any agenda of work and actually what happens afterwards can be quite different to what we're expecting in that period of adaptation, can be quite a challenge, but it's a really important one. And I'm yeah, I think it's really great. I'm really grateful for you sharing it.

So I'm conscious that we've thrown the agenda to the wind. Who cares? This is a really important issue. So what we're going to do now is if we've got 10 minutes from Meilys to do some Q&A, if that's OK because they've been coming through quick and fast on the chat group. So thank you everybody for sending them through. And once we've had 10 minutes of Q&A, we'll go straight into our breakout workshops that we've got, and we will just cut down our feedback session a bit later on. So that's the plan.

2:07:56

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

So I'm going to go straight into some questions if that's OK Meilys. Let me see what's the first one that we've got through. Sorry, they've come into a different chat, bear with me one second whilst I get a grip. Ah, they've all gone. If anybody is able to just pop those into the chat for me now, Nerys is coming online now. Nerys is going to save me, amazing.

2:08:47

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

I am going to save you. OK, we've got a question from Fen about how the PSB has been involved, and whether you think there's a role for the PSB in this space.

2:09:03

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Yeah, I think it's on the PSB's radar there, but there's a there's a disconnect between what's happening at PSB level to local authority level or county level I should say and the local community level. And I think there is a lot to be learned locally and this is just my perspective from my sort of level. It does feel currently as if it's kind of a piece meal approach to individual villages or towns that people are quite new to the party, quite late coming to the party and I welcome this sort of event because I think it will help everybody to think about its importance. But as somebody alluded to earlier, see that it's not separate to everything else, it's just about people having a good life in their community essentially and obviously there are some technical aspects to it but yeah, no not enough is the general answer from me.

2:10:10

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

OK. And then there's another one here from Charlotte about, and I hope I'm getting this right Charlotte in terms of interpreting the question, what existing mechanisms have been identified to deliver some of the short and longer-term actions?

2:10:26

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Yes so this is an interesting one and actually in the next project board meeting in January, there's going to be a paper listing some options, really interesting question. So we have a project board with five work streams and for me a project by default is something with sort of a beginning, a middle and an end. It's something to deliver on something, but in Fairbourne, and this is what the community evidently wants, it's turned into something where statutory bodies turn up and the community throw questions at us. So they see it as their access to officers who can answer their questions or concerns. It doesn't feel as a partnership if I'm honest. It doesn't feel as if there's much delivery. So what we're looking at now are different mechanisms for delivery which ideally, and I suppose it's quite ironic that officers from statutory bodies are saying this, but as officers what we're hoping is that the community think of something where they're in the driving seat, they're setting

the agenda but recognising that maybe they need some of the skill set of the expertise that we have around things such as planning, doing project plans, doing grant applications, doing business cases, all of those things that they trust us to be able to pull us in and support them with those things. But they're setting the agenda, but also that they have the trust in us that we're sharing the right information at the right time because information is evolving all the time. So, you know, one minute you might be planning for a short or medium term thinking that the long term is never going to be there, but depending on what comes out of the most recent research, it might be slightly different position and that we find that there will be more investment. There's around, and I can't remember the terminology, but things such as you know are we holding the line or not essentially and that has a massive impact on where your money will go and what Welsh Government will fund. So it's a good question. It's something I'm working through with the community and struggling with a little bit.

2:12:39

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

Thank you. I think it's quite a dynamic governance situation, isn't it? Do you want me to pick up on this translated question Rebecca?

2:12:54

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yeah, I've got so one from Nia, which is around did you see people moving into the community and buying up property after the risk in that community have been realised from flooding?

2:13:05

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

We did. You know this is one of my points about not making assumptions. I think I was making assumptions that people wouldn't buy a house in Fairbourne because they knew what was likely to happen. But COVID changed the dynamic quite dramatically. And as in many places, people moved to rural North Wales knowing that they could work online such as this, and people moved into Fairbourne in the same way that they did to other places and property values went up. So it kind of buckled the trend. So it just demonstrates how important it is to keep in tune with the community you're working with. And so, yes, very, very interesting. And there were some assumptions within the community itself about the availability of mortgages, for instance, and availability of insurance and that kind of thing. And because of Savills kind of expertise in that sort of field, they were able to shine a light on some of the reality and the truths about some of those assumptions made by the community itself. It's a very interesting dynamic in terms of people still coming in.

2:14:13

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

That sounds incredibly valuable from a community perspective in terms of having that opportunity to ask those questions of Savills and have an organisation like that be able to respond on their behalf. I can see how that would be a really powerful thing. We talk about mental health and wellbeing, don't we? And actually what people need is security. And if you take away that security it has a huge impact on people and actually to be able to provide some of that security and reassurance, it's probably one of the more positive things you can do to support people's mental health and wellbeing.

2:14:42

Meilys Heulfryn Smith (OEDOLION)

Yeah, definitely. And you could see a rapport and a bond developing between Savills and some of the key community members in a very short period of time. So on the face of it, I was thinking you know what we've spent £40,000 and in one respect it's not much more than what we'd do with any kind of engagement on all sorts of topics. But then when you saw Savills in action with the community, and when we could draw on their expertise and their knowledge, we could see where the value was really coming from. So that was a bit of learning as well about the importance of the right people undertaking the assessment.

2:15:26

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

It sounds like a hugely valuable piece of work and engagement. Have we got time for one more question Nerys or do we need to go? No, fair enough. I'll stop being a bad chair. Right thank you Meilys, I really appreciate your time and coming to talk to us today. It was a really fascinating piece of work and thanks for sharing Llion's email address as well, because we'll be able to get back in touch if people have got any further questions or want to see a copy of the report. So I'm going to hand over to Nerys now, who's going to take over from my really bad time management chairing and figure the rest of it out.

2:15:57

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

Thank you. Thank you so much Meilys, I knew there'd be a lot of interest in Meilys's presentation, so thank you, Meilys so much for sharing your learning from the process. Can you see my slides Rebecca and does it say activity one on it?

2:16:18

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Yes it does.

2:16:19

Nerys S. Edmonds (Public Health Wales - Matrix House)

OK, great. So what we're going to do now is we're going to go into a breakout group and there's going to be two activities. And I think it's really important, this is an opportunity for participants, for all of you today to feed into the development of this risk assessment process and the framework and there's two activities we're going to ask you to do. The first one is just to think about, this isn't about coming up with all the answers, but it's beginning to think about how would you in your local area, think about who might be vulnerable to extreme heat. How might you assess how vulnerable different groups in your community are. And what might be the impacts on the overall community well-being and where might you get the evidence from?

So we're not expecting you to know the answer to this, but it's beginning to think through how might you go about answering those questions in your community or for your PSB area? And don't worry, these instructions will be posted in the chat in your breakout groups.

The second activity is really a chance for you, we've had quite a lot of dialogue already I think about what's the capacity in the local system, what's the skills, what's the knowledge base, this is your chance to feed into that to say well, what's already happening about adaptation? What capacity and skills already exist? Where are the gaps or the barriers? Who might need to be engaged in a local climate risk assessment being led by PSB's?

We will have note takers in each group. And it's really your chance to feed in your insights and you know, ideas, concerns, where you think there might be opportunities. So the notes will be fed into that process. We will be sharing that with our colleagues in Natural Resources Wales. So please do use this opportunity to help inform the risk assessment framework.

Just a few little notes about how the breakouts are going to work. So they're not going to be recorded. So we have got a note taker in each group to write down your ideas, write down your concerns and provide that feedback. We're aware that you can't at the moment put on your cameras and unmute yourself, but once you're in the breakout groups, you can turn on your camera, unmute yourself and please do introduce yourselves to each other and get involved in the discussion. Lastly, I need to let our facilitators know that we've switched the groups around a little bit. So Eurgain you're going to be with Helen, Michael you're going to be with Tracy as your note taker, Fen you're going to be with Helga, Jordan you're going to be with Steve Meaden, Lee you've got Sara as your note taker and Holly you're with James as your note taker.

So everybody's got a note taker. We weren't quite sure we were going to pull that off before about 10 minutes ago. So we have got seven groups and we've got note takers in each one. So we hope those breakouts will be useful. We're going to come back to the main plenary afterwards, but we're not going to do verbal feedback. We'll just be doing some finishing polls and some closing remarks, and we'll ask you to fill in an evaluation form. So without further ado if people could be put into breakout groups, please and your facilitators will take you from there.

Thanks everybody and thanks ever so much to all our presenters.

2:20:03

Rebecca Masters (Public Health Wales)

Final few responses just coming through. I'm really conscious of time and just wanted to say thank you absolutely everybody for joining us here today, for staying through. It's rare I've seen so many participants stay through right to the bitter end and that's really welcome. And it shows the commitment and enthusiasm and interest that people have in this agenda.

I just wanted to reiterate my thanks to all of the speakers that we've had here today who have given their time and expertise to come and share with us their examples, their best practice and the work that they've been doing. But I wanted to say a special thank you to Cath and Marie and Nerys who've been diligently working behind the scenes to try and make sure that all the tech and everything gets set up, is working and is undertaken so diolch yn fawr iawn. It literally wouldn't have happened without the support of the Network coming together to make this a possibility. And thank you to all of our facilitators and notetakers who enabled us to make this a reality. So and to close off it's a diolch yn fawr iawn from me, thank you again everybody for joining us. And if you've got any feedback, we would love to hear from you. We'll circulate something after the session, but for now good to see you all today. Enjoy the rest of your day and we'll see you again shortly, I'm sure.